6. CASE 24.105, 200 LEXINGTON AVENUE, John E. Brown, Two-family House, 1897 (SOUTH ELMWOOD)

2½-story clapboarded structure with a mansard roof and Queen Anne and Colonial Revival detailing. It has a ful1height octagonal corner pavilion whose first floor is open to form an entrance porch fronted by thin Tuscan columns. CONTRIBUTING



Arrow indicates 200 Lexington Avenue



Arrow indicates project location, looking north.

Applicant/Owner: Eran Shavelsky, YUD Real Estate, 425 Parker Street, Newton, MA 02459

Proposal: The scope of work proposed consists of Major Alterations and includes:

removal of the existing mansard slate roof and the installation of an architectural-shingle roof.

Issues: The following issues are relevant to this application:

- The modification will be visible from the public right-of-way; and,
- The applicant has submitted two quotes: 1) Milligan Construction (dated 08/07/24), with the slate roof being reported as in good condition. The issue with the building is the apparent failure of the built-in gutter system (\$91,000.00), which appears to be causing water infiltration into the property; 2) Karvia Construction (dated 06/13/24), with the roof and gutters replaced (\$18,000).
- Staff is unconvinced that the slate roof needs to be removed. Mansard slate roofs are known for having the longest lifecycle,
 and this roof is prominent on the property; additionally, no information has been given as to what the proposed replacement
 for the gutter system will be. Staff assumes an aluminum gutter is proposed, and this would be inappropriate architecturally.
 There are various know options for approximating trough gutters architecturally correct and these should be explored; and,
- Quotes and photos have been submitted.

Recommendations: The staff recommends the PHDC make the following findings of fact:

- a) 200 Lexington Avenue is a structure of historical and architectural significance that contribute to the significance of the South Elmwood local historic district, having been recognized as a contributing structure to the Elmwood National Historic Landmarks District;
- b) The application for Major Alterations is not complete; and,
- c) The applicant is to return with additional information, specifically options for keeping the slate roof and fixing/replacing the trough gutter system with an appropriate architectural system.

Staff recommends a motion be made to continue the application, with the applicant to return with additional information, specifically options for keeping the slate and fixing/replacing the trough gutter system with an appropriate architectural system.



Milligan Construction LLC

55 Porter St. Providence, R I 02905 Slate Roofs & Copper Work (401)-781-5878 Cell phone (401) 954-7278

Assessment of slate roof condition for 200 Lexington Avenue Providence, RI 02907

The slate in general is in good condition, the slate is good quality Manson Black is nail down well, size 7X14. There are areas where poor installation and repairs have been

made in attempt to stop the aging process or a leak, these areas need replacement to preserve a traditional natural and beautiful stone roof.

With our close inspection, this is what we discovered to bring back the slate roof to standards.

- 1. Replace built in gutters \$91,000.00.
- 2. Remove starter slates to install built in gutters properly under the slates \$32,500.00.
- 3. Replace install custom made copper apron flashing on windows \$8,800.00.
- 4. Install custom made copper drip edge on small flat roofs \$5,670.00.
- 5. Install rubber on small flat areas \$5,040.00.
- 6. Rental of scaffolding \$19,500.00.

Total to repair \$162,510.00

Any additional crack or rotten wood found after slate and built in gutters remove will be replaced at additional expense, I have miss couple of areas to measure that need to add on this estimate. This estimate does not include city permit fees, if you have any questions can call me anytime.



Quote # QT-000389

Karvia Construction LLC

92 Spring St. Lincoln, Rhode Island 02838 401-692-7026 dave@karviaconstruction.com

Quote Date: 13 Jun 2024

Expiry Date: 13 Jul 2024

Bill To **Eran Shavelsky**

Subject:

200 Lexington Mansard Roof

#	ltem & Description	Qty	Rate	Amount
1	Remove slate shingles, and rubber roof coverings from mansard roof. Install new architectural asphalt shingle and new rubber roof coating. Install external gutters. Install flashing and caulking as needed. ***PLEASE NOTE that until roof is stripped, we cannot determine if wood needs to be replaced or how much. Once roof is stripped, notification will be made of findings and any necessary price changes for labor and material.***	1.00	18,500.00	18,500.00
		Sub Total		18,500.00
			Total	\$18,500.00

Notes

Thank you for the opportunity to earn your business! Please don't hesitate to reach out with any questions and remember to ask about our financing options.

1







